

Label the elements of  $R$  as  $x_1, x_2, \dots, x_k$ . Since there are at most  $k$  distinct elements in the set  $\{x_1, x_1^2, \dots\}$ , there must exist

$r_1 < r_2 < \dots$  such that

$$x_1^{r_1} = x_1^{r_2} = \dots$$

By considering  $\{x_2^{r_1}, x_2^{r_2}, \dots\}$ , we see similarly that there exist a subsequence  $s_1 < s_2 < \dots$  of  $\{r_i\}$  such that  $x_2^{s_1} = x_2^{s_2} = \dots$ .

Repeating this construction a finite number of times, we arrive at a sequence

$n_1 < n_2 < \dots$  such that

$$x_i^{n_1} = x_i^{n_2} = \dots \quad \text{for } 1 \leq i \leq k.$$